

The Security Council of the United Nations (UNSC) Reform; between Reality and Hope (A Critical and Analytical Study)

Prof. Mekhled. E. Al-Tarawneh,
Department of Law/Police College - Police Academy/State of Qatar.

The Security Council of the United Nations (UNSC) Reform; between Reality and Hope

(A Critical and Analytical Study)

Prof. Mekhled. E. Al-Tarawneh,

Department of Law/Police College - Police Academy/State of Qatar.

ABSTRACT

This paper addresses the subject of reforming the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) and the possibility of achieving the reform process from a practical point of view. The main question that this paper is attempting to answer is whether the reform of this important body of the UN possible from a theoretical and practical point of view.

The research raised many questions related to the importance of reforming the Security Council (SC) and amending its current composition in line with the changes and new developments that have occurred in the international community.

The paper also discusses the importance of reviewing the voting system currently in effect in the SC and the extent of the possibility of reviewing it and setting some controls or restrictions on the issue of the use of the veto by permanent member states. It also deals with many other issues, such as the issue of forming the SC, the method of voting, and the criticisms directed to this mechanism.

The research also addressed the reasons and justifications that require carrying out the reform process for the SC, and the most prominent initiatives and proposals that were presented in this regard to develop the work of this important body.

The paper is divided into three sections; the composition of the SC and its voting system, the reasons for the SC reform and its justifications, a discussion of some examples of the drafts and proposals related to SC reform including those of some Arab countries.

Key words: The United Nations (UN), Security Council (SC), Permanent members, Nonpermanent members, Veto, Collective Security, Reform, International Community, International peace and security.

المُلخَص

إصلاح مجلس الأمن التابع للأمم المتحدة؛ بين الواقع والمأمول (دراسة نقدية وتحليلية)

الأستاذ الدكتور مخلص الطراونة

عضو هيئة التدريس - كلية الشرطة، أكاديمية الشرطة. دولة قطر

يتناول هذا البحث موضوع إصلاح مجلس الأمن التابع للأمم المتحدة، وإمكانية تحقيق عملية الإصلاح من الناحية العملية. والسؤال الرئيسي الذي يحاول هذا البحث الإجابة عليه هو ما إذا كان إصلاح هذا الجهاز المهم التابع للأمم المتحدة ممكناً من الناحيتين النظرية والعملية. أثار البحث العديد من التساؤلات المتعلقة بأهمية إصلاح مجلس الأمن، وتعديل تركيبته الحالية، بما يتناسب مع التغيرات والتطورات الجديدة التي طرأت على المجتمع الدولي.

كما يناقش البحث أهمية إعادة النظر في نظام التصويت المعمول به حالياً في مجلس الأمن، ومدى إمكانية مراجعته، ووضع بعض الضوابط أو القيود على مسألة استخدام حق النقض من قبل الدول الدائمة العضوية. كما يتناول العديد من القضايا الأخرى مثل مسألة تشكيل مجلس الأمن وطريقة التصويت فيه، والانتقادات الموجهة لهذه الآلية.

كما يتناول البحث الأسباب والمبررات التي تتطلب القيام بعملية الإصلاح لمجلس الأمن، وأبرز المبادرات والمقترحات التي قُدمت بهذا الخصوص لتطوير عمل هذا الجهاز المهم. لقد قُسم البحث إلى ثلاثة مباحث هي: تكوين مجلس الأمن ونظام التصويت فيه، أسباب إصلاح مجلس الأمن ومبرراته، مناقشة بعض الأمثلة على المبادرات والمقترحات المتعلقة بإصلاح مجلس الأمن بما في ذلك تلك المقدمة من بعض الدول العربية.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الأمم المتحدة، مجلس الأمن، الأعضاء الدائمون، الأعضاء غير الدائمين، الفيتو، الأمن الجماعي، الإصلاح، المجتمع الدولي، الأمن والسلم الدوليين.

Introduction

The UN was founded in 1945 after the World War II by 51 countries wanting to never again see the horrors of war. In that war the world witnessed the gross violations that took place in the field of human rights and the danger to stability for peace and security for the whole planet. As a result, the Allied countries began to think about establishing an international organization that would have the capacity and authority to maintain international peace and security at the international level and prevent further human rights violations.⁽¹⁾ The drafters of the UN charter succeeded in adopting the final version of the charter and ultimately signed it at the San Francisco (USA) conference on July 26, 1945.⁽²⁾ The UN Charter officially came into force on October 24, 1945.⁽³⁾ The UN was established to achieve four main goals namely: to maintain international peace and security, and⁽⁴⁾ to reach these goals it was based on seven main principles.⁽⁵⁾ The UN is also composed of six principal organs,⁽⁶⁾ namely the General Assembly (GA), the Security Council (SC) and the (ICJ)....etc.⁽⁷⁾

It is worth noting that since the establishment of the UN in 1945, it has been working diligently and forcefully to maintain international peace and security⁽⁸⁾, protect human rights, and uphold international law.⁽⁹⁾ Over the last 75 years, the UN membership and relevance has grown, and it now has 193 member states and is considered as the world's largest and most important international organization.⁽¹⁰⁾

(1)* Mekhled. E. Altarawneh, Department of Law/Police College/Police Academy/State of Qatar.

¹ Mekhled Altarawneh, *An Introduction to International Organizations*, (Book in Arabic) Dar Al Badeel for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 2023, pp.127-136.

(2) Ibid.

(3) See Article 110 of the UN Charter. For more details about the UN see <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/history-of-the-un>. The provisions of the UN Charter, available at <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter/full-text>

(4) See Article 1 of the UN Charter,

(5) See Article 2 of the UN Charter,

(6) See for further details about the UN bodies <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/main-bodies>. See also for more details Mekhled Altarawneh, *supra* note 1, pp.169-245.

(7) See for more details about this body <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/main-bodies>.

(8) See the Role of the UN Security Council", Institute of International and European Affairs, Keynote Speech by United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Michelle Bachelet, 0n May, 2021, available on <https://www.ohchr.org/en/2021/05/protecting-human-rights-role-un-security-council>.

(9) The UN has been involved in human rights issue since its establishment in 1945, for more details about the role of UN in this context https://www2.ohchr.org/english/OHCHRreport2017/allegati/2_About_UN_Human_Rights_2017.pdf

(10)https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/united-nations/?utm_source=google&utm_medium=cpc&gclid=EAIaIQobChMI1KzgoY3QgQMVzgWiAx2f7AoPEAAAYAiAAEgLSJPD_BwE. See for more details Anjali Dayal and Caroline Dunton, The UN Security Council was Designed for Deadlock, Can it Change? <https://www.usip.org/publications/2023/03/un-security-council-was-designed-deadlock-can-it-change>.

Importance of the research:

Anyone who traces the UN's work and how it performs its functions will find that this organization is unable today to face many of the challenges and dangers occurring on the international level. The UN is currently suffering from what could be described as a chronic aging disease and is unable to carry out its original functions and deal with the new tasks assigned to it, especially after the successive developments that have occurred at the level of the international community. Therefore, the need for changing and reforming the structure and functions of the UN to confront the rapid and successive developments has today become necessary and inevitable.⁽¹¹⁾ One of the most important bodies of the UN, that needs a real reform is the SC. This organ is basically responsible for the maintenance of international peace and security in the world.⁽¹²⁾ The current composition, which includes 15 members, has not undergone any amendments or changes since the last amendment to the UN Charter in 1965. Since then, the overall membership of the UN has nearly quadrupled to 193, but there has been no further expansion of the SC⁽¹³⁾, despite the massive increase in the number of independent states, which joined the UN.⁽¹⁴⁾

It is obvious that, achieving and implementing the idea of maintaining international peace and security needs the presence of a clear and comprehensive vision and the adoption of effective tools to achieve security and stability for humanity as a whole and not for specific countries.⁽¹⁵⁾

(11) Wanda Troszczynska-Van Genderen, *Reforming the United Nations: State of Play, Ways Forward*, available [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/536435/EXPO_STU\(2015\)536435_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/536435/EXPO_STU(2015)536435_EN.pdf).

(12) The UN Charter has designated Chapter Five for the SC (Articles 23-32). See UN Charter available <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter/full-text>.

(13) Elisabetta Martini, *UN SC Reform: Current Developments*, available at <https://www.iai.it/sites/default/files/iai0926.pdf>.

(14) Stewart Patrick, *Cutting the Gordian Knot: Global Perspectives on UN SC Reform*, <https://carnegieendowment.org/2023/06/28/un-security-council-reform-what-world-thinks-pub-90032#:~:text=Even%20as%20the%20UN's%20overall,from%20eleven%20to%20fifteen%20members>. See also Rajiv Bahatia, *A Proposal For UN Security Council Reform, Task force: Towards Reformed Multilateralism: Transforming Global Institutions and Frameworks*, May, 2023 available at <https://policycommons.net/artifacts/3793075/a-proposal-for-un/4598910/>.

(15) Hassan Nafiah, *Why the UN Must Reform the Security Council*, available at <https://www.swissinfo.ch/ara/business/%D9%84%D9%85%D8%A7%D8%B0%D8%A7-%D9%8A%D8%AC%D8%A8-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%85>.

The maintenance of international peace and security can primarily be achieved through reform of the SC, strengthening its powers and enhancing its effectiveness, so that, it reflects the reality of geopolitics, which currently exists in the international community.⁽¹⁶⁾ Today, with profound changes in the realities of the global community, the SC is being questioned in terms of its legitimacy, effectiveness, and representativeness.⁽¹⁷⁾ As a result of these changes, some countries are constantly demanding to join the SC, in order to be among the permanent members, because of their political and financial influence at the international level, such as Germany, Brazil, India, South Africa, Japan, and others.⁽¹⁸⁾ Another issue that many countries have focused on is the excessive use of the right of veto without justification or contrary to the principles of international law. This particular issue has clearly made negative impact on the work of the Council, and its effectiveness in resolving international crises.

It is worth noting that the disruption of the Council's work during some international crises, especially after the Russian attack on Ukraine in February 2022, and currently, after the brutal attack by Israeli forces on Gaza on October 7, 2023, demonstrated the urgent need to address the imbalance and inability facing the SC in some cases. These two examples and others have shown the great importance of amending the composition of the SC and developing its work mechanisms to confront the challenges that hinder it from carrying out its work.⁽¹⁹⁾

Research problem:

The international community has completely changed over the last 75 years. The large increase of the UN membership helped to transform it into a global institution that includes almost all the countries and peoples of the world for the first time in its

(16) See for more details UNSC Reform, available at <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100059111.pdf>

(17) Ibid.

(18) Reform of the UN Security Council, available at <https://www.auswaertiges-amt.de/en/aussenpolitik/internationale-organisationen/vereintenationen/reformsr/231604#:~:text=When%20the%20Charter%20of%20the,came%20into%20force%20in%201965>.

(19) For further details about this war and its impact and effects see Scott Neuman and Alyson Hurt, The Ripple Effects of Russia's War in Ukraine Continue to Change the World, February 22, 2023, <https://www.npr.org/2023/02/22/1157106172/ukraine-russia-war-refugees-food-prices>. See also the speech of Under-Secretary General A. DICARLO'S Remarks to the SC on Maintenance of Peace and Security of Ukraine, New York, 23 June 2023 available at <https://dppa.un.org/en/msg-usg-dicarlo-sc-9357-ukraine-23-jun-23>. The UNSC has so failed to adopt a resolution calling for a ceasefire in the Gaza Strip. <https://www.aljazeera.net/news/2023/10/17/>.

history.⁽²⁰⁾ Since its establishment, the UN has faced many challenges and obstacles that have hindered its work and reduced its effectiveness to resolve conflicts that have enormously threatened international peace and security.⁽²¹⁾ However, the UN has often been called upon to prevent disputes from escalating into war, or to help in restoring peace.⁽²²⁾ These important goals of the UN came as a natural result of the role assigned to it, which is confirmed by the preamble of the Charter itself “*To save succeeding generations from the scourge of war...*”.⁽²³⁾

It is worth mentioning that the sources of threats to international peace and security are no longer limited to wars between countries, but many other sources have emerged such as civil wars, environmental dangers⁽²⁴⁾, poverty⁽²⁵⁾, diseases and others.⁽²⁶⁾ These issues made the work of the SC so difficult, especially towards achieving the concept of collective security on the ground.⁽²⁷⁾ Therefore, it became clear that the UN, with its current charter, existing working mechanisms and decision-making process, has become unable to cope with the global developments and changes, and is no longer suitable to lead the current international system.⁽²⁸⁾

Accordingly, the new collective security system, must be able to deal with all sources of threats facing humanity, and be equipped with the required mechanisms that enable it to confront all of these dangers at all times.⁽²⁹⁾ Hence, the efficiency of

(20) Mekhled Altarawneh, supra note 1, pp.127-131.

(21) Gareth Evans Stewart Patrick and Homas Leney, Threats, Challenges and Change: The UN in the 21st Century, available at <https://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/threats-challenges-and-change-the-united-nations-the-21st-century>.

(22) <https://www.un.org/en/global-issues/peace-and-security>

(23) Ibid.

(24) Javier Santiago OrtizCorrea and Ariel Dina Civil War's Impact on The Environment and on Access to Water and Sanitation Services: The Case of Colombia, Sustainable Water Resources Management (2022) 8:151 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40899-022-00718-w>, available at <https://escholarship.org/content/qt0t41k9vx/qt0t41k9vx.pdf>.

(25) Helge Holtermann, Poverty and Civil War: An Assessment of Four Prominent Explanations of the Per Capita Income-Civil War Relationship, available at <https://www.duo.uio.no/bitstream/handle/10852/14771/Thesis6.pdf?sequence=2>

(26) See for more details Crime and Contagion: The Impact of a Pandemic on Organized Crime, <https://globalinitiative.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/GI-TOC-Crime-and-Contagion-The-impact-of-a-pandemic-on-organized-crime-1.pdf>. See for further details the UN report about conflicts and violence <https://www.un.org/en/un75/new-era-conflict-and-violence>

(27) Hassan Nafiah, supra note 15.

(28) Hassan Nafiah, supra note 15.

(29) For more details about the Collective Security concept see Stevens Lloyd Osisoma, United Nations and Collective Security, GSC Advanced Research and Reviews, 2023, 14(02), 115–120, Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30574/gscarr.2023.14.2.0014>, available at <https://gsconlinepress.com/journals/gscarr/sites/default/files/GSCARR-2023-0014.pdf>. See also Ademola Abass, International Law, Oxford University Press, 212, pp.385-406.

the collective system⁽³⁰⁾ to maintain peace and security should not be assessed on the general meetings that take place at the SC after the outbreak of crises or wars, but the SC should be provided with all capabilities and resources, which are necessary to enable it to carry out all the tasks in an efficient manner. Moreover, the SC must also be subject to accountability, review and monitoring and should not be as a political means between the hands of permanent members to achieve its own interests or goals. ⁽³¹⁾

In view of the foregoing, this paper discusses the importance of starting the reform process of the SC, in order to strengthen its ability and efficiency to maintain international peace and security. The real reform of the SC shall take into account the actual map of the global balance of power that currently exists, because the current representation of the SC does not reflect this fact.⁽³²⁾ Therefore, the SC regularly faces steady calls for reform to better meet the twenty-first-century changes and challenges⁽³³⁾, particularly righting the historical injustice of Africa and Latin America exclusion from permanent seats.⁽³⁴⁾ Moreover, the decision-making mechanism in the SC must also be changed, in order to prevent any permanent member from paralyzing the work of the SC.⁽³⁵⁾ This paper attempts to answer two hypotheses: The first one is whether the current composition of the SC and its decision-making process, as well as the current system of collective security, are sufficient and capable of confronting the challenges and resolving the crises facing the SC? The second hypothesis stems from the importance of reviewing the provisions of the UN Charter, especially those related to the SC. Accordingly, as many states suggested, it is necessary to reform the SC at the present time, provided that the reform process

(30) For more details about the Collective Security System see https://unrcca.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/4-unrcca_handout_collective_security_system_eng_2020.pdf. See also Martin Dixon, *International Law*, 7th ed, Oxford University Press, 2013, pp.332-333.

(31) Hassan Nafiah, *supra* note 15.

(32) See Manish S. Dabhade, *India's Pursuit of UNSC Reforms*, Volume 2, Issue 3 (Rising India and Its Global Governance Imperatives), Aug. 2017, pp. 63-73, available at <https://risingpowersproject.com/indias-pursuit-untied-nations-security-council-reforms/>.

(33) <https://www.cfr.org/background/un-security-council>.

(34) SC Must Reflect Twenty-First Century Realities, Delegates Tell General Assembly, with Many Calling for Urgent Expansion of Permanent Seats, available at <https://press.un.org/en/2020/ga12288.doc.htm>

(35) Article 24/1 from the UN Charter.

takes into account the issue of the Council's composition and the right to veto.⁽³⁶⁾

This research generally attempts to prove the hypothesis that if the current international developments and changes, which came out as a result of the changes in the balance of powers and the emergence of new powerful countries and that are politically and economically influential on the international scene, then these conditions or circumstances prove the importance of reforming the SC. Nevertheless, the political will of the member states of the SC, in particular the permanent members, prevents any real reform of the SC in order to preserve the interests and rights that they have acquired since the end of World War II. Therefore, in order for the reform process to be fruitful and real the efforts of all countries need to be combined together. It is necessary for them to work hand in hand to make the reform process successful and to establish a Council that is more representative, democratic and transparent.

Research Questions, Methodology and Division:

A descriptive and analytical approach will be used to address the problem of this research and discuss the legal and other points raised in this paper and attempt to answer the most important questions it raises. One of these questions is whether the current composition of the SC is sufficient and appropriate to achieve and reach its goals or not? Is the current SC voting system appropriate and fair or not? Are the time and current circumstances appropriate and mature enough to amend the composition and voting system of the SC? Do the powerful states have really serious and sincere intention to support such reform and implement it in reality? What are the main projects or proposals related to the SC reform?

In order to answer these questions and others, this paper is divided into the following sections: The first section deals with the composition of the SC and its voting system. The second section deals with the reasons for the SC reform and its justifi-

(36) For more details about the origins and history of the Veto and Its use see Jennifer Trahan, Existing Legal Limits to SC Veto Power in the Face of Atrocity Crimes, Published online by Cambridge University Press: 15 August 2020, available at <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/existing-legal-limits-to-security-council-veto-power-in-the-face-of-atrocity-crimes/introduction/02FEB9A9FFFA863F492EE2AC079FB49D>. See Dilip Sinha, Veto Provisions in UN Charter: Issues and Dimensions, Indian Foreign Affairs Journal Vol. 14, No. 4, Special Issue: India and the 'UN@75' (October–December, 2019), pp. 267-274 (8 pages) Published By: Prints Publications Pvt Ltd, available at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/48636736>.

cations. The third section discusses some examples of the initiatives and proposals related to SC reform and it will highlight the nature of the reform projects presented by the UN and some other parties to the SC.

1. Composition of the SC and its Voting System:

The SC is considered one of the most important organs of the UN. It occupies a prominent and important position among the main organs of the UN, as the Charter grants it broad competencies and powers, in order to maintain international peace and security.⁽³⁷⁾ The SC has the authority to acknowledge situations that threaten or disturb international peace and security, or the occurrence of cases of aggression.⁽³⁸⁾ The UN Charter did not precisely define these instances, but rather it gave the power to the SC to determine whether an action falls under any of these particular situations or not. Accordingly, the SC will deal with this matter in the form of binding resolutions that might include the imposing of economic sanctions to military actions.⁽³⁹⁾ Hence, the decisions of the SC are distinguished by their decisive legal value and the strength of their enforcement.⁽⁴⁰⁾

As for the issue of forming and the composition of the SC⁽⁴¹⁾, this was stated in the text of Article 23. Based on the text of this Article the SC consists of 15 members, five are permanent members and 10 are non-permanent members. The five permanent members are the USA, UK, China, the former USSR (Russia⁽⁴²⁾) and France. Notably, the seat of Russia as a legitimate and legal heir for the former USSR remained relatively unchallenged and not subject to any discussion or disagreement until the outbreak of the conflict between Russia and Ukraine in February 2022⁽⁴³⁾.

(37) M. Shaw, *International Law*, 3 ed, Cambridge University Press, 1994, p.750. See Articles 23, 24, 25 and 28 of the UN Charter. For more details about the SC see Mohammad Almjoud, *Alwaseet in International Organizations* (Book in Arabic), Al-Halabi Legal Publications, Beirut, 2018, pp.274-288.

(38) See the provisions related to SC included in chapter V of the UN Charter 23-32, See also for more details Edress lakreny, *The Security Council in a Changing World: The Reality of Deviation and the Requirements for Reform*, (Arabic Article), <https://www.mohamy.online/blog/11241/%D9%85%D8%AC%D9%84%D8%B3-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%86-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D8%B9%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%85>.

(39) See Article 39.

(40) Article 25 of the UN Charter

(41) Ayed Al-Mashaghbeh, *The United Nations Security Council, It's Role in Enhancing the International Criminal Justice*, (Book in Arabic, PhD thesis), published, Aldar Alalmiah for Publishing and Distribution, 2018, pp.36-38. See also about the UN Security Council <https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/un-security-council>.

(42) See Yehuda Z. Blum, *Russia Takes Over the Soviet Union's Seat at the United Nations*, 3 Euro. J. Int'l. 354,356, 1992. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ejil/3.2.354>

(43) What You Need To Know About the Russian and Ukrainian Conflict available at https://giveuao.org/2023/05/24/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-russian-and-ukrainian-conflict/?gclid=EA1aIQobChMiiODL9uDAgQM-VCE4YCh0wZQ4mEAAYAiAAEgLq1fD_BwE. See also John J. Mearsheimer, *The Causes and Consequences of the Ukraine War*, <https://www.cirsd.org/en/horizons/horizons-summer-2022-issue-no.21/the-causes-and-consequences-of-the-ukraine-war>.

The number of non-permanent members is 10 and they are elected for a term of two years. Their election to the council are subject to two criteria. The first is the contribution of these countries in the maintenance of international peace and security and to the other purposes of the UN organization. The second is the equitable geographical distribution;⁽⁴⁴⁾ the ten non-permanent SC seats are distributed according to four regional electoral groupings: Africa and Asia, Eastern Europe, Latin America and the Caribbean, and the Western European and other states.⁽⁴⁵⁾ According to the provisions of the Charter the five permanent members (P5) have two privileges in this regard.⁽⁴⁶⁾ The first privilege was to obtain permanent seats within the SC and the second privilege is to enjoy the right of veto. This gives the five permanent member states the right to object any decision that the member state deems not compatible with its interests.⁽⁴⁷⁾ The justification behind those two privileges can be explained due to historical circumstances as well as power politics in 1945.⁽⁴⁸⁾

In terms of its composition, we can say that the previous distinction between the permanent and non-permanent membership is not acceptable and criticized, because it contradicts with the principle of equal sovereignty⁽⁴⁹⁾, which is considered one of the fundamental principles of the UN.⁽⁵⁰⁾ Moreover, the limitation of permanent membership to specific members by name on the basis that they represent major powers is clearly based on a political assessment necessitated by the circumstances of World War II. Therefore, to ensure the proper functioning of the organization, the current composition of the council needs to be reconsidered, particularly the permanent membership in terms of its number and type of countries that enjoy it, in a way that takes into account the changes that have recently occurred in the international

(44) Mekhled Alltarawneh, *supra* note 1, pp.188-192.

(45) See un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/186/66/PDF/NR018666.pdf?OpenElement, see for more details Brian Lai, Vanessa A. Lefler, UN Security Council Nonpermanent Membership: Equitable Distribution for Equitable Representation?? available at <https://myweb.uiowa.edu/bhlai/workshop/lailefller.pdf>

(46) Mekhled Altarawneh, *supra* note 1, pp. 188-192.

(47) *Ibid.* See also Jennifer Trahan, *supra* note 41, see also see also. See Mohammad Almjoud, *supra* note 37, pp 188-192.

(48) M. Shaw, *supra* note 37, p.750.

(49) See Article 2/1.

(50) Hans Kelsen, The Principles of Sovereign Equality of States as a Basis For International Organizations, https://openyls.law.yale.edu/bitstream/handle/20.500.13051/13231/17_53YaleLJ207_1943_1944_.pdf?sequence=2&is-Allowed=y, see also Brad R. Roth, The International Law of Sovereign Equality, <https://academic.oup.com/book/8765/chapter-abstract/154897084?redirectedFrom=fulltext>.

arena.⁽⁵¹⁾ The voting system in the SC was also one of the issues that was subject to much discussion and criticism.⁽⁵²⁾ This system distinguishes between procedural issues and substantive issues. In procedural matters, the SC's decisions are issued by a majority of 9 votes, while on substantive or non-procedural matters, decisions are issued by a majority of 9 votes, including the votes of permanent member states in agreement. This means that a negative vote by any of the permanent members (P5) is sufficient to veto or block any resolution of the SC, save with regard to procedural matters, where 9 affirmative votes are all that is required.⁽⁵³⁾

The practical practice of the SC has proven its lack of impartiality, objectivity, politicization of issues and matters. Moreover, the repeated use of veto by the permanent member states can paralyze the movement of the SC and obstruct its work in a very negative way. This has prompted some countries in the UN to constantly demand its abolition.⁽⁵⁴⁾ In brief, the permanent members use the veto to defend their national interests, to uphold a tenet of their foreign policy or, in some cases, to promote a single issue of particular importance to a state. When we track the number of times the right of veto has been used throughout the history of the UN, we find that statistics indicate frightening numbers in this regard. Since 16 February 1946, -when the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) cast the first veto- the veto has been recorded 293 times.⁽⁵⁵⁾

The General Assembly (GA) has also called in several recommendations to reduce its use, because abolishing veto is a very difficult issue from a practical point of view. The five permanent members (P5) will not agree on any initiative or proposal that might touch this right. Therefore, the majority of jurists have demanded to keep this right for the major powers, but they called to restrict and reduce its use in a manner that should not paralyze the work of the SC.⁽⁵⁶⁾ For these reason and others,

(51) See for more details Mekhled Altarawneh, *supra* note 1, pp.189-190, see also Ayed Al-Mashaghbeh, *supra* note 41, pp.36-40. H. Bekhouche, *The Need to Reform the United Nations*, (Article published in Arabic), 2021, Volume 5, Number 2, Pages 111-131 available at <https://www.asjp.cerist.dz/en/article/172504>.

(52) See Article 27 of the UN Charter.

(53) Article 27 of the Charter, see M. Shaw, *supra* note 37, p.750.

(54) See for further details <https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/un-security-council-working-methods/the-veto.php>

(55) *Ibid*.

(56) Jennifer Trahan, *Why the Veto Power Is Not Unlimited: A Response to Critiques of, and Questions About, Existing Legal Limits to the Veto Power in the Face of Atrocity Crimes*, *Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law*

many calls were made by a number of countries to demand the reforming of the SC and amending the system on which it is based. The calls for SC reform started in the nineties of the last century⁽⁵⁷⁾ and have continued strongly throughout the current century, especially after the important report prepared by Kofi Annan and presented to the (UNGA) in 2005.⁽⁵⁸⁾ The main aim behind that reform, according to the GA, to enable the SC to perform its work in a very efficient way, in order to maintain international peace and security.⁽⁵⁹⁾

In the same context, some other countries also called for major reforms in the UN organs, particularly the SC through strengthening their presence in the council in what they believe is compatible with their international influence. Recently, there are some demands and calls to develop the work of the Council and modify its current composition, after the United States expressed its approval and great support for such initiatives.⁽⁶⁰⁾ Nevertheless, other countries do not see any benefit from these initiatives and proposals, particularly, in the current conditions which witness the increase of international polarization after the outbreak of the Russian-Ukrainian war.⁽⁶¹⁾

2. The Reasons for the SC Reform and Its Justifications:

The concept of reform within the framework of the United Nations means the process of transforming or abolishing existing perceptions, ideas, structures, institutions and procedures, and may include the establishment of new institutions. The primary goal of this reform is to achieve the maximum institutional effectiveness of the UN

(JIL), volume 54, Issue 1, 2022, available <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2628&context=jil> . Kalfan Kreem, The Security Council and the Challenges of Global Peace and Security, a Study in Light of Proposals for Reform of the United Nations, (Article in Arabic Language), Al-Feker Journal, Volume 9, Number 1, 2014, pp.39-59 available <https://www.asjp.cerist.dz/en/article/39475>.

(57) Boutros Boutros-Ghali on Security Council Reform, Magisterial Lecture on Security Council Reform, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Mexico City, Mexico, 4 March 1996, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/security-council/security-council-reform/32814-boutros-boutros-ghali-on-security-council-reform.html>

(58) See for full text of the report <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/images/pdfs/briefing.pdf>, see also Secretary General Kofi Annan's Reform Agenda - 1997 to 2006, <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html>.

(59) Khalid Alyemany, The Reality of Security Council Reform (Article in Arabic language), available at <https://www.independentarabia.com/node/463541/%D8%A2%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%A1/%D8%AD%D9%82%>.

(60) Aude Darnal, Biden and the United Nations Security Council Reform: True Commitment or Tokenism? available <https://www.stimson.org/2022/biden-and-the-united-nations-security-council-reform-true-commitment-or-tokenism/>.

(61) <https://www.brookings.edu/articles/how-russias-invasion-of-ukraine-tested-the-international-legal-order/>.

and its various branches in general.⁽⁶²⁾ During the GA Session (72) on September 18, 2017, around 120 countries expressed their commitment to the reforms proposed by UN Secretary-General *António Guterres*. Since 1946, the UN has undergone a number of reforms, either in whole or in part. These reforms, which the UN has undergone through its history have included a various issues, “including restructuring the permanent membership of the UN Security Council (UNSC),...etc.”⁽⁶³⁾ However, the term ‘reform’ itself has proved troublesome for UN member states on account of its lack of clarity and the lack of consensus as to execution.

Accordingly, what is called reform of the UN is considered a primarily political issue, as it is linked to the attitude that some major powerful countries are seeking to impose on the international organization itself. This attitude basically reflects the reality of the existing conflict and struggle between countries that wish to carry out a real reform process for the UN, so that it can effectively play the role specified for it and other countries that do not support any reform for the SC and want to keep the current situation as it is (*status quo*), because it serves their interests and achieves their goals.⁽⁶⁴⁾ After this introduction, I will explain the most important reasons and justifications stand behind the SC reform process.

2.1. No Amendments Have been Made to the UN Charter For a Long Period of Time:

It is worth noting that, the Charter of the UN, especially the articles specifically related to the SC, has not been subject to any amendment or review since its adoption except once, in 1965. In that amendment, the number of seats in the SC was increased to 15 from only 11 seats, and the number of affirmative votes required was also increased from seven to nine.⁽⁶⁵⁾ After that important step, the issue of amending or changing the provisions of the UN Charter was not addressed.⁽⁶⁶⁾

(62) FeKrat Alaney, The New International Environment and Necessities for UN Reform, (Article in Arabic Language, published 2023), p.1 available at <https://www.iasj.net/iasj/download/45bd61b644520292>.

(63) See for more details United Nations reform available at [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/635517/EPRS_BRI\(2019\)635517_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/BRIE/2019/635517/EPRS_BRI(2019)635517_EN.pdf)

(64) FeKrat Alaney, supra note 62, p.2.

(65) Can the UN Charter be amended, and how many times has this occurred? Available at <https://ask.un.org/faq/140440#:~:text=The%20Charter%20has%20been%20amended,votes%20from%207%20to%209.>

(66) See Articles 108 and 109 from the UN Charter, UN full text is available at <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter/full-text>

The long period of time in the life of the UN and its practices have demonstrated many strengths in the work of this organization and its various bodies.⁽⁶⁷⁾ However, it has also showed the existence of some weaknesses and defects in terms of the provisions of the Charter itself or in the mechanisms that have been used in the decision-making process within the UN system, especially the SC. The failure of the member states of the UN to resort to the process of amending the Charter confirms the real unwillingness of these countries, particularly the permanent members of the SC, of not making any radical and real amendments to the UN Charter, in order to preserve their political interests.

2.2. International Changes and Current Developments:

The UN was established in 1945 by organizing the countries of the world in a new form of a collective security system that sought to achieve international peace and security. This system created international mechanisms for peaceful settlement of disputes between states.⁽⁶⁸⁾ If this system failed, or in case of threats to international peace and security caused by the behavior of one or several states, the UNSC has the full right or competence to use international armed force to manage this threat.⁽⁶⁹⁾ The term “collective security” is based on the need to defend the international public order.⁽⁷⁰⁾ The concept of collective security is totally different from both the right of self-defense and public security.⁽⁷¹⁾ Accordingly, the UN included, both formally and theoretically, an integrated system in which all the necessary pillars were available to ensure its effectiveness through adoption of common principles and rules.⁽⁷²⁾ These rules and principles, can be implemented through the establishment of an executive body, responsible for implementing UN resolutions and maintaining international peace and security.⁽⁷³⁾

(67) See Abo Baker Dosuqey, Sixty Years of the United Nations: Obstacles to Reform, (Article in Arabic) *AlSyeasieh Aldolieh Journal*, Issue 162, 2005.

(68) Article 2/3 from the UN Charter, see also chapter 6 of the Charter Articles 33-38.

(69) See Article 39, 40, 41, 42 and 43 from the Charter, see also *The Practical Guide to Humanitarian Law*, 2023, available at <https://guide-humanitarian-law.org/content/article/3/collective-security/>

(70) See <https://www.yourarticlelibrary.com/international-politics/collective-security-meaning-nature-features-and-criticisms/48490>.

(71) Mekhled Altarawneh, supra note 1, pp.25-26, see also Mofeed Shehab, *International Organizations*, (Book in Arabic Language), Dar Al-Nahda, Egypt, 1985, pp.15-20.

(72) See Article 1 and 2 from the UN Charter.

(73) See Chapter VI of the UN Charter.

The UN succeeded to some extent at the beginning in achieving its goals and aims.⁽⁷⁴⁾ However, experiences and practical practice quickly demonstrated the weakness of the collective security system included in the Charter. This failure or weakness came as a result of the conflict between East and West, which caused the emergence of what is known as the Cold War between the Western camp led by the United States (USA) and the Eastern camp led by the former Soviet Union (USSR).⁽⁷⁵⁾

It should be noted, that this war cast a negative shadow on the efficiency of the UN, especially the SC. The SC has been unable in many occasions to carry out its duties and tasks due to the use by the major powers of the right of veto. This situation also created a negative impact on the concept of collective security and its implementation in certain cases.⁽⁷⁶⁾ The period that came after the end of the cold war, witnessed a kind of unity or consensus among the members of the SC regarding some issues and cases, that were presented to the SC due to the United States' control of the SC and its dominance of the global political scene. During that period, which lasted for some years, the SC succeeded in adopting and passing many important resolutions related to some issues or cases. It also managed to take many resolutions related, in particular to military interventions on the basis of Chapter VII in some countries, such as Iraq, Somalia, Rwanda, Haiti and other examples.⁽⁷⁷⁾ However, this consensus and cooperation among the major powers in the SC began to disappear gradually following the emergence of Russia as an active state on the international scene and its close cooperation with China. This cooperation and coordination between the two countries regarding some issues presented to the SC brought to mind once again the stereotypical image of SC that was entrenched for a long period during the Cold War period.⁽⁷⁸⁾

(74) See Article 1 of the UN Charter.

(75) For more details about the Cold War see <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/cold%20war>. See also Harlan Cleveland, 2006. <https://www.archives.gov/research/foreign-policy/cold-war/symposium/cleveland.html>

(76) Mark Kramer, The Collapse of the Former Soviet Union, *Journal of Cold War Studies*, Volume 5, Issue 1, Winter 2003, available at <https://direct.mit.edu/jcws/article-abstract/5/1/3/12584/Introduction?redirectedFrom=fulltext>

(77) Abo Baker Dosuqey, *supra* note 67. Kapil Kak, Humanitarian Intervention and the Changing Role of the UN, *A Monthly Journal of the IDSA*, October 2000 (Vol. XXIV No. 7), [Shttps://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/olj/sa/sa_oct-00kak01.html](https://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/olj/sa/sa_oct-00kak01.html). See also for more details about the SC interventions in some countries Mekhled Altarawneh, *The Legality of Humanitarian Intervention in the Light of UN Charter and Contemporary International Law*, (PhD), Aberdeen University, UK, 1999, published in 2023, Dar Athaqafa, Amman, Jordan, 2023, pp.264-85.

(78) <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/4/19/un-to-debate-security-council-permanent-member-veto-power>.

The current situation of the international community is more complicated with the growing role of Russia and China on the international arena. The emergence of political and economic conflicts between them and the Western powers had a negative impact, on the performance and effectiveness of the SC and its interaction with the serious issues presented to it. This can easily be proven by reviewing some of the cases presented to the SC, namely Palestine, Syria and Ukraine crises.⁽⁷⁹⁾

In the Syrian crisis, for example Russia used the veto more than 17 times to obstruct any decision against the Syrian regime.⁽⁸⁰⁾ In the Ukrainian crisis, which is the most recent example, we have also noticed how the SC has dealt with this serious and complicated conflict. This crisis has demonstrated the deep problem that is facing the SC in achieving his work and function. The SC failed miserably to adopt any resolution related to the Russian attack on Ukraine, because of Russia's repeated use of veto.⁽⁸¹⁾ It has obstructed any resolution that might condemn its attack of this independent country.⁽⁸²⁾ However, the GA was able to pass a resolution denouncing the invasion of Ukraine by Russia. The measure was adopted by a vote of 141 in favour to 5 against with 35 abstentions a clear reaffirmation of the 193-member world body's commitment to Ukraine's sovereignty, independence, unity and territorial integrity.⁽⁸³⁾ It, therefore, demanded the Russian Federation to immediately end its invasion of Ukraine and unconditionally withdraw all its military forces from that neighboring country.⁽⁸⁴⁾ Similar behavior can be found being repeated currently in the recent Israeli aggression on Gaza, in which the SC has failed to take any decisions related to the recent escalation in this region, whose residents have been exposed to the worst forms of killing and genocide by the Israeli occupation army since October 7, 2023. The Russian draft resolution to halt combat operations and allow

(79) UN to debate Security Council permanent member veto power, available at <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/4/19/un-to-debate-security-council-permanent-member-veto-power>

(80) Richard Croker, Russia's Justification for Using its Veto on Syria is Pure Fiction, available at UN General Assembly 21 July 2022 (Transcript of the speech, exactly as it was delivered <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/russias-justification-for-using-its-veto-on-syria-is-pure-fiction.ar>).

(81) War in Ukraine, Center Prevention Action, August 15, 2023, <https://www.cfr.org/global-conflict-tracker/conflict/conflict-ukraine>. See also Conflict in Ukraine: A timeline (2014 - eve of 2022 invasion) available at <https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/cbp-9476/>

(82) See for more details S.C. res. S/2022/155 (Feb.25,2022). See also UNSC,8979 meeting agenda, S?pV.8979, at 6.

(83) See Press Releases SC/14808 and SC/14809 for details.]

(84) See <https://press.un.org/en/2022/ga12407.doc.htm>

humanitarian aid has failed due to a veto by the United States, the United Kingdom, and France in the SC.⁽⁸⁵⁾ There is no doubt that such events and rapid changes on the international scene have affected and continue to affect the work system of the SC and its ability to take effective and influential decisions to achieve collective security.⁽⁸⁶⁾ Hence, we can say that keeping up with the various developments and changes that occur constantly is usually a very important matter in confronting the challenges and obstacles facing the international community.

The above mentioned changes and developments since the establishment of the UN might be considered as an impetus and an important reason for reviewing the provisions of the Charter and amending it, in line with the current international situation.⁽⁸⁷⁾ Finally, one should mention that the role of the developed countries on the international arena has been greatly diminished and decreased and the nature of conflict has also changed from the west and east to become between the North and the South.⁽⁸⁸⁾ Additionally, some new issues and crises have emerged internationally, such as those related to development, unemployment, poverty, migration, climate change, high food and medicine prices, internal armed conflicts. In addition, the spread of diseases and epidemics, such as the Corona virus (Covid-19), which has affected all countries of the world and increased the challenges and difficulties facing some countries.⁽⁸⁹⁾ Furthermore, the emergence of some new actors on the international scene, such as non-governmental organizations⁽⁹⁰⁾ and civil society institutions⁽⁹¹⁾, and the proliferation of multinational companies, also led to changes in the international community.⁽⁹²⁾ These bodies have played an important and vital

(85) See Article 24 of the UN Charter. See for more details UN news, October, 17, 2023 available at <https://news.un.org/ar/story/2023/10/1124947>

(86) Bertrand Ramcharan, A New International Law of Security and Protection, available at <https://www.un.org/en/chronicle/article/new-international-law-security-and-protection#:~:text=Sovereign%20states%20still%20predominate%20and,powerful%20states%20or%20voting%20majorities>.

(87) See Article 1 of the UN Charter.

(88) North-South Divide in the World, available at <https://encyclopedia.pub/entry/37558>

(89) Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, Obstacles to Security Council Reform and New International Changes, Political Science Journal, Issue 60, 2020, pp.97-98. Available at <https://jcopolicy.uobaghdad.edu.iq/index.php/jcopolicy/article/view/487/399>

(90) James Paul, NGOs and the Security Council, article published 2004 available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/security-council/ngo-working-group-on-the-security-council/40406.html#background>

(91) <https://www.humanrights.com/voices-for-human-rights/human-rights-organizations/non-governmental.html>

(92) Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, supra note 89, pp. 97-98.

role in drawing attention to some issues that affect international peace and security, such as human rights violations, providing food and medicine, reducing conflicts, combating global warming and climate change,⁽⁹³⁾

Moreover, the emergence of new countries with great economic and political influence, and the spread of international and internal armed conflicts have also had negative impact on international peace and security, as well as on relations and co-operation among countries.⁽⁹⁴⁾ Therefore, as a result of these issues and challenges many countries stressed, in many sessions of the General Assembly (GA), the importance of saving the UN and radically and deeply reforming its various institutions⁽⁹⁵⁾, especially the SC, in order to cope with these radical and dramatic changes.⁽⁹⁶⁾ Some others have even invoked article 109, which calls for general conference of the members of the UN for the purpose of reviewing the present.⁽⁹⁷⁾

2.3. Repeated Demands, Calls, and Pressures from Some Countries to Join the SC:

The SC, in its current composition, does not represent the will of the international community or express the map of the global and regional powers in the current international political system. Today, the number of the UN has dramatically increased and reached 193 members. This means that the ratio between the number of SC members and that of the UN members was severely disturbed. The ratio of representation of the UN, when it was established was (1 to 7) approximately and with the increase of the number of the members, it has become today around (1to18). Moreover, the permanent membership has also been kept closed for the five big powers or victorious countries in the World War II.

(93) See https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Publications/FSheet38_FAQ_HR_CC_EN.pdf. See also Climate change and human rights – Can the courts fix it? <https://reliefweb.int/report/world/climate-change-and-human-rights-can-courts-fix-it>. Bruno Simma and others, eds., The Charter of the United Nations: A Commentary vol. I, 3d ed.(Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2012), p.111.

(94) Ibid.

(95) Security Council Reform: 67th Session, 67th SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY, REPORTS & ANALYSES, available at <https://centerforunreform.org/security-council-reform-67th-session/>

(96) Bekhouche, supra note 51, see also <https://www.un.org/ar/ga/67/resolutions.shtml>.

(97) See Article 109 of the UN Charter.

All these facts have made the Council lose its credibility in its representation of the map of the balance of powers in the international community, especially since some of the defeated countries in World War II began to take their political and economic role strongly and effectively on the international level. Furthermore, a huge number of developed countries gained their independence and became members in the UN. Additionally, the major step, which accelerated the need for a general reform of the UN was the collapse of the former Soviet Union in 1990. The West celebrated its seeming triumph and some even declared “the end of history.”⁽⁹⁸⁾

For these reasons and others, some countries pressurized the UN to join the SC as permanent members. Many African countries called for reviewing the composition of the SC and giving them the real representation they deserve. The number of African countries in the United Nations is 54 countries, and this is one of the biggest representation in the UN.⁽⁹⁹⁾ However, the African countries are not represented among the permanent members, unlike other continents, such as the European continent, which are represented in the SC with three permanent members, namely the UK, France and Russia. There are also requests from some other countries such as Japan and Germany, to get the full permanent membership in the SC on the grounds that they contribute with a large percentage to the UN budget.⁽¹⁰⁰⁾ We also found strong demands from India to obtain a permanent seat as it is the largest country in terms of population.⁽¹⁰¹⁾ In Latin America, we found similar requests from Brazil and Argentina, as well as other pressures from other countries from different continents such as Spain, Italy, South Korea, Canada and other countries.⁽¹⁰²⁾

Such requests and calls, which are reasonably justified necessitate a general review of the charter of the UN, especially those articles related to the SC, to cope with the changes and developments that have taken place on the international arena.⁽¹⁰³⁾

(98) David L. Hoffmann, The Soviet Collapse, Article published in 2021, https://origins.osu.edu/article/soviet-collapse-yeltsin-putin-gorbachev-russia?language_content_entity=en

(99) <https://www.un.org/dgacm/ar/content/regional-groups>, see also <https://www.france24.com/ar/20170923-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%85>.

(100) <https://www.un.org/en/ga/contributions/honourroll.shtml>

(101) <https://www.worldometers.info/world-population/population-by-country/>

(102) Abo Baker Aldosokey, Sixty Years from the UN: Obstacles Before Reform, (Article in Arabic Language), Published in Political Science Journal, Issue 162, 2005.

(103) See for more details FeKrat Alaney, *supra* note 62, pp.3-5.

3. Some Examples of Initiatives and Proposals Related to Reforming the Security Council (SC):

There have been many proposals and initiatives presented by a number of countries, different bodies and formal persons, such as the Secretaries-General of the UN to reform the SC. These initiatives, attempts and projects started in the early stages after the establishment of the UN, particularly in the mid-fifties of the last century. Some of these initiatives and suggestions succeeded in making a crucial step towards the changing of the structure of the SC in 1965, when the number of members of the SC was increased to 15.⁽¹⁰⁴⁾ After that amendment to the UN charter, no other amendments were made related to the SC⁽¹⁰⁵⁾.

The need for such a reform of the SC is very important, in order to make the SC more effective, inclusive and able to respond quickly and effectively, when faced with situations that threaten international peace and security. There is no doubt, that the presence of a strong, effective SC that is quick to make its decisions without bias or abuse of its powers under the Charter will help in the implementation of the collective security system in more flexible and fair way. It will also prevent the misuse of the right to veto in a way that obstructs the achievement of international justice and paralyzes taking the necessary decisions to confront dangerous situations, that could endanger international peace and security. The need for this change and reform has obviously become an important and indispensable issue, especially after Russia's attack on Ukraine in 2022.⁽¹⁰⁶⁾

The SC's failure to act on Russia's unprovoked invasion of Ukraine *"has reignited long-smoldering global demands to overhaul the world's premier body for international peace and security."*⁽¹⁰⁷⁾ In this context, the USA administration has stressed many times the importance of starting the process of SC reform to make the council able to achieve its duties. This trend that the United States began to accept was

(104) Stewart Patrick, supra note 14.

(105) See <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter#:~:text=Since%20the%20UN's%20founding%20in,1963%2C%201965%2C%20and%201973>.

(106) See John B. Bellinger, How Russia's Invasion of Ukraine Violates International Law, February 28, 2022, available <https://www.cfr.org/article/how-russias-invasion-ukraine-violates-international-law>. See also <https://law.stanford.edu/2023/02/21/stanfords-allen-weiner-on-russias-invasion-of-ukraine-and-the-laws-of-war/>

(107) Stewart Patrick, supra note 14.

different from its previous position towards the Council's reform process, which it strongly opposed at the beginning. Its former representative in the Council, Mr. John Bolton, expressed his rejection of the idea of expanding the Council. He said in this context: *"the SC must be effective and influential and the process of expanding it by increasing its members may hinder its progress and disrupt its work"*.⁽¹⁰⁸⁾ In his speech to the GA in Sep/2022, the U.S. President Joe Biden expressed his support for the UNSC's reform. After repeating long-standing U.S. support for *"increasing the number of both permanent and non-permanent representatives,"*⁽¹⁰⁹⁾ Biden also added that:

"The United States now endorses not only "permanent seats for those nations we've long supported"—that is, Japan, Germany, and India—but also "permanent seats for countries in Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean."⁽¹¹⁰⁾ President Biden said the U.S. has *"undertaken serious consultation with many member states. And we'll continue to do our part to push more reform efforts forward, look for points of common ground, and make progress in the year ahead."*⁽¹¹¹⁾ He also affirmed the United States' support for increasing the number of permanent and non-permanent representatives in the UN Security Council (UNSC). The President mentioned, in particular, the inclusion of countries from Africa, Latin America, and the Caribbean.
(112)

Some of these initiatives and suggestions that have been presented to improve the SC's working-system and reform it in a manner that serves the international legitimacy and justice will be briefly examined below. Other initiatives and suggestions related to other organs of the UN will not be examined in this paper.

3.1. Previous Initiatives and Proposals of the Secretaries-General:

One of the initiatives to reform the UN in general and the SC in particular, was presented during the nineties of the last century by former Secretary-General Boutros

(108) For more details about all these proposals and initiatives regarding the SC reform see Sami Jad Wasel, Reform of Security Council, Article published in Arabic, in Journal of Law and economics, issue 95, pp.316-417.

(109) Stewart Patrick, supra note 14.

(110) Stewart Patrick, supra note 14.

(111) <https://www.voanews.com/a/biden-s-call-to-expand-uns-c-membership-likely-to-go-unheeded-/7279316.html>

(112) Aude Darnal, supra note 60.

Ghali on 17 June 1992,⁽¹¹³⁾ pursuant to the presidential statement adopted by the SC at its summit meeting on 31 January 1992. The Secretary General submitted to the Council a report entitled “*An Agenda for Peace: preventive diplomacy, peacemaking and peacekeeping*”.⁽¹¹⁴⁾ The report contained, as requested, his analysis and recommendations on ways of strengthening and making more efficient, within the framework and provisions of the Charter, the capacity of the UN for preventive diplomacy, peacemaking and peacekeeping to which he had added the closely related concept of peacebuilding.⁽¹¹⁵⁾

The second imitative in this context came from the former Secretary-General of the UN Mr. Kofi Anan. After taking office in January 1997, Mr. Anan announced his plan for UN reform. He set out an agenda of better management and coordination across the entire UN system, as well as stronger human rights promotion and peacekeeping operations.⁽¹¹⁶⁾ In March 2005, Annan presented his most comprehensive reform and policy agenda to date. His report “*In Larger Freedom*” addressed issues such as terrorism, financing of development, enlarging the SC and replacing the Human Rights Commission (HRC).⁽¹¹⁷⁾ Annan wanted countries to accept all proposals as a package and urged delegations to come to consensus in time for the Millennium+5 Summit, before the 60th session of the General Assembly in September 2005.⁽¹¹⁸⁾

Secretary-General Annan formed for this purpose a number of working groups, including a high-level working group or panel that was formed to study the threats and challenges facing the world and provide suggestions for making appropriate changes to confront them. The High Level panel presented its report to the Gener-

(113) For more details about all these proposals and initiatives regarding the SC reform see Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp.393-408.

(114) (S/23500, 1992), see also https://www.un.org/en/sc/repertoire/89-92/Chapter%208/GENERAL%20ISSUES/Item%2029_Agenda%20for%20peace_.pdf

(115) (An agenda for peace, 1992), *Ibid*.

(116) <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html>.

(117) Secretary General Kofi Annan's Reform Agenda - 1997 to 2006, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html#:~:text=In%20March%202005%2C%20Annan%20presented,replacing%20the%20Human%20Rights%20Commission.>

(118) Jens Martens, 2005, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/images/pdfs/briefing.pdf>, see also Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 147, pp. 404-408.

al-Secretary, it indicated that reform of the SC must take into account some basic points or principles to make the reform a real process and not a formality devoid of its content. The suggested principles include firstly, that the reform process should entail the participation in decision-making of those who make the greatest contributions to the UN in terms of financial, political, and military aspects. Secondly, this reform should lead to the participation of states, which are the most representative of the broader base of members, especially from developing countries, in the decision-making process within the SC. Thirdly, the reform process will not lead to weakening the SC and reducing its current role, and finally, it should increase the democratic character of the SC and make it more accountable.⁽¹¹⁹⁾

Kofi Annan regards overcoming the “anachronistic” composition of the SC as a central element of the UN reform. However, rather than committing himself to a concrete reform proposal, “*he refers to the two models presented by the High-level Panel*”. Both aim at enlarging the SC from a current 15 seats to 24.⁽¹²⁰⁾ The Security Council reform Model (A) provides for six new permanent seats, with no veto being created, and three new two-year term non-permanent seats, divided among the major regional areas as follows⁽¹²¹⁾:

Regional area	Number of States	Permeant Seats (continuous)	Proposed New Per-meant Seats	Proposed two-year seats (non-renewable)	Total
Africa	53	0	2	4	6
Asia and Pacific	56	1	2	3	6
Europe	47	3	1	2	6
Americas	35	1	1	4	6
Totals model A	191	5	6	13	24

Model (B) provides for no new permanent seats but creates a new category of eight four-year renewable-term seats and one new two-year non-permanent (and non-re-

(119) Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, *supra* note 89, pp101-102.

(120) *Ibid.*

(121) Available at <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N05/270/78/PDF/N0527078.pdf?OpenElement>

newable) seat, divided among the major regional areas as follows⁽¹²²⁾:

Regional area	Number of States	Permeant Seats (continuous)	Proposed four-year renewable seats	Proposed two-year seats (non-renewable)	Total
Africa	53	0	2	4	6
Asia and Pacific	56	1	2	3	6
Europe	47	3	2	1	6
Americas	35	1	2	3	6
Totals model A	191	5	8	11	24

The Secretary -General urged at that stage for the states to agree on one of the two models or on another proposal based on these models ahead of the Summit in September 2005. The candidates for a new permanent seat (Germany, Japan, Brazil and India) interpreted this proposal as being in support of their position and vision for the Council. Therefore, they strongly called for a vote to be taken in the General Assembly before the end of the summer of 2005. Since the African Union states did not succeed to reach an agreement on their two candidates for a permanent seat, the goal of that group was to adopt a “*structure resolution*” *without concrete country proposals in the General Assembly by June 2005 and determine the names of the countries at a later stage.*” With regard to those countries in support of Model (B) (including Italy, Mexico, South Korea and Pakistan) they stressed the need to arrive at a decision by consensus and criticized at the same time the Secretary-General’s indirectly taking sides.”⁽¹²³⁾

Additionally, the High Level Panel stressed importance of reviewing the SC structure or composition in 2020. The team also assured in this context that the reform process and the proposals presented in this regard will not affect the right to veto or the current powers of the SC specified Charter. Nevertheless, the High Level Panel

(122) Available at <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/N05/270/78/PDF/N0527078.pdf?OpenElement>, see also for more details Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, supra note 89, pp101-102.

(123) See also Sami Jad Wasel, supra note 108, pp. 404-408.

was not satisfied with such reform, as it is inconsistent with the values of democracy, transparency and accountability that should exist in this type of bodies, which exercises important and sensitive powers and functions. The High Level Panel also recommended the need to include in the Council's internal regulations new methods for improving transparency and accountability in the SC.⁽¹²⁴⁾

The efforts of the UN Secretaries-General, including the current Secretary-General *Guterres*, have continued in this regard to reform the SC, in order to preserve the Council's credibility and effectiveness in making appropriate decisions, when conflicts and international crises erupt. Despite of all this, nothing has changed, and the council reform file has not moved forward despite the continuous appeals and calls regarding this issue. Moreover, the differences and conflicts between countries on international level are still increasing and becoming more complex than before, especially after the recent outbreak of the Russian-Ukrainian War in 2022, and the deterioration of the relationship between Russia and the United States on the one hand and between the latter and China on the other. Additionally, the differences or disagreement between the rest of the developing countries of the world over who deserves to obtain the permanent membership have hindered such efforts. Furthermore, the international scene also becomes more complicated, when discussing and reviewing the right to veto, how it should be used, and the restrictions that must be imposed on the five permanent members, when resorting to it.⁽¹²⁵⁾

Briefly, it can be said that the reform process does not need many initiatives or proposals presented from this side or that side. Reforming the SC requires the permanent member states to have a real and sincere intention to put it into practice, and this requires from the five major countries more rapprochement and sincere and constructive cooperation to complete this file, which has been discussed for many years. I do not believe that these countries, are serious about carrying out a real, fruitful and effective reform process for the SC. These countries are beneficiaries of the current

(124) Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, *supra* note 120, p.103.

(125) See for more details about the right to veto -<https://www.justsecurity.org/81294/the-united-nations-in-hindsight-challenging-the-power-of-the-security-council-veto/>, see also André Nollkaemper, Three Options for the Veto Power After the War in Ukraine, available at <https://www.ejiltalk.org/three-options-for-the-veto-power-after-the-war-in-ukraine/>.

situation, and they will not allow any amendment or change that would affect their interests, that they have acquired since the end of World War II.

3.2. Other Initiatives and Proposals Regarding the SC Reform:

In addition to the above-mentioned proposals, there have been some other proposals presented by many countries in the UN demanding and stressing the importance of the SC reform.⁽¹²⁶⁾ For example, many countries, which are members of the Non-Aligned Movement (NAM), have requested to correct its representation in the SC, in order to make it more democratic and fair. These countries proposed amending the composition of the Council by adding 11 new members. One of the initiatives that have been suggested in this regard came from the G4.⁽¹²⁷⁾ This includes four countries, namely Germany, Brazil, India and Japan. These countries called for the expansion of the SC, so that the number of non-permanent members as well as permanent members is increased. They suggested in 2005 to increase the number of seats within the Council from 15 to 25, six permanent and four non-permanent, in order to reflect the geo-political situation on the international level. The new permanent members shall not exercise the veto-right until a decision has been taken during a review (15 years after the reform).⁽¹²⁸⁾ The 6 seats should be distributed as follows: Africa(2), Asia-Pacific(2), Latin America and the Caribbean(1), Western Europe and other(1). Whereas the 4 non-permanent seats should be allocated as follows: Africa (1 or 2), Asia, Pacific(1), Eastern Europe(1) and Latin America and Caribbean(1).⁽¹²⁹⁾

The African Union proposed in 2005 as well that the SC should be reformed, and it suggested in this regard to increase the permanent seats to 11.⁽¹³⁰⁾ The new 6 seats should be distributed as follows: Africa (2), Asia-Pacific (2), Latin America and the Caribbean (1), Western Europe and other (1). It also suggested increasing the number of non-permanent seats to 15 members instead of 10. The new proposed seats according to the African Union initiative should be distributed as follows: Af-

(126) General Assembly Hears Renewed Appeals for Substantive Security Council Reform, *supra* note 39. See also see also Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp. 411-416.

(127) See also Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp.413-415.

(128) <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100059111.pdf>.

(129) <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100059111.pdf>.

(130) See also Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp.414-416.

rica (2), Asia Pacific (1), Eastern Europe (1) Latin America and the Caribbean (1). With regard to the veto, the Union demanded the abolition of veto but as long as it exists, it should be extended to all members including the new permanent members. (131) Sierra Leone's representative, speaking on behalf of the African Group, said in this context *"Member States must correct an historical injustice by providing Africa with five non-permanent and two permanent Council seats. We will not compromise the integrity of the African position for the sake of having just any kind of reform that will not stand the test of time"*. (132)

Some other countries such as Sweden, Argentina, and Mexico proposed the enlargement of the SC through increasing its only non-permanent members, with the condition that it guarantees just and fair representation for all countries. (133) China's representative said the Council *"must not become a club for big and rich nations, and that failure to redress the overrepresentation of developed countries will make decision-making more undemocratic"*. (134) However, China still has reservations about the issue of granting both India and Japan permanent seats in the SC for political and historical reasons necessitated by the nature of the tense relations between these countries over the past decades. (135)

Italy as one of Uniting for Consensus (UFC) proposed in this context to increase the number of non-permanent seats to 21 and the creation of a new category of membership based on longer-term non-permanent seats. (136) It suggested the extension of the term from 2 years to 3-5 years for non-permanent seats. It also suggested, unlike the G4 Group to keep the number of permanent members as it is (5) without any change (*status quo*). (137) However, Italian representative, in 2020, who spoke on behalf of (UFC) called for increasing the permanent members of the Council to 9 member instead of 5, this increase should take into account the geographical distribution.

(131) Ibid. See for more details Elisabetta Martini, supra note 13.

(132) <https://press.un.org/en/2022/ga12472.doc.htm>

(133) <https://www.iasj.net/iasj/article/37225>

(134) <https://press.un.org/en/2022/ga12472.doc.htm>

(135) Sami Jad Wasel, supra not 108, pp.419-422.

(136) The UFC (Uniting for Consensus) is a group of approximately 40 States, whose leaders include Italy, Pakistan, South Korea and Colombia. See <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100059111.pdf>

(137) See for more details Elisabetta Martini, supra note 13.

The USA also suggested to enlarge the council to include Germany and Japan as permanent members. The USA was clear in its position towards the reform of the SC. It seems that it would not accept any enlargement of the permanent membership of the SC that did not include Germany and Japan as well as Brazil.⁽¹³⁸⁾ The USA affirmed that the enlargement of the SC will give it more moral discretionary power in the world, and will also make the UN more efficient. The representative of the USA went on to say: *“This Government would not agree to any change in the status, powers and obligations of the current permanent members, which were countries with global political and economic influence and a capacity to contribute to international peace and security. The total Council membership should not exceed approximately 20 seats”*⁽¹³⁹⁾.

However, the American officials have continuously admitted that the implementation of the reform process is very complicated and it needs some time before it is achieved. Other permanent members of the SC such as the UK, France and Russia have also resisted at the beginning the idea of reforming the SC, because they were clearly fearing the loss of the privileges, that they enjoy in the SC to other countries, especially to Germany and Japan.⁽¹⁴⁰⁾ Russia, at the beginning refused making any substantial change to the UN charter and enlargement of the SC. It believes that the current situation for the SC is appropriate and any change to the current composition of the SC will affect the effectiveness of the SC.⁽¹⁴¹⁾ However, we have recently seen some changes in this regard, Russia supports expanding the SC and granting Germany permanent membership without the right of veto, but it rejects the demands made by some countries, especially the Group 4, which demanded permanent seats for all of them in the SC, in addition to two African countries. There are some calls from Russian officials, such as its Foreign Minister *Lavrov* to support this reform, in order to accommodate African, Asian and Latin American nations in the UNSC.

(138) <https://press.un.org/en/1996/19961030.ga9147.html>

(139) Ibid.

(140) See Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp.417-420.

(141) Fekrat Alaney, *supra* note 80, pp.7-8.

(142) Nevertheless, Russia has called for further consultations and discussions to reach understandings about the process of reforming the SC, so that this matter does not create a rift in relations between member states of the UN.⁽¹⁴³⁾

The UK and France have shared the same position and stressed the importance of not touching the privileges that the five permanent members enjoy.⁽¹⁴⁴⁾ In their view, any changes or amendments to the UN charter that might touch these privileges, particularly abolishing the right of veto will destroy the UN organization. However, we have begun to witness at the present time an important change in their positions towards reforming the SC. For example, in 2003, the Commonwealth Office issued a report recommended increasing the number of permanent members to 10, so that Germany, Japan, India, and one of the American and African countries would each be given a seat in the SC. The report also stressed that the right of veto should be limited to permanent member states and cannot be granted to countries proposed to join the SC.⁽¹⁴⁵⁾

With regard to France's position from the reform process, it does not differ much from the positions of other great powers. It supports the reform of the SC and granting some countries, especially the G4, and other African countries, a fair representation in the SC, particularly the permanent membership.⁽¹⁴⁶⁾

In summary, the great powers apparently support the reform process of the SC, but in reality, strongly believe that the current composition of the SC is appropriate and sufficient, because it preserves their interests and rights.⁽¹⁴⁷⁾

3.3 The Position of Some Arab Countries Relating to the Security Council Reform:

Within some Arab countries, one can notice strong support for the SC's reform process. For example, the State of Qatar expressed its support for the reform of the UNSC and called for improvements in the council's working methods and decision-making mechanism. During his participation at the 71st session of the UNGA,

(142) https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/russia-strongly-supports-reform-of-un-security-council-says-lavrov-123012400017_1.html

(143) See Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, p.419.

(144) Fekrat Alaney, *supra* note 62, pp.7-8.

(145) See Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp. 417-418.

(146) See also Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp. 417-418.

(147) *Ibid.*

the Emir of the State of Qatar, Sheikh Tamim bin Hamad Al Thani, criticized the weakness in the legal and institutional system of the UN. He mentioned in this regard:

“The international community faces serious challenges represented by some unresolved regional and international crises that have become an obstacle to regional and international development and stability. Some countries continue to follow the approach of acting outside the scope of international legitimacy in light of international failure to implement Security Council resolutions. It is no longer possible to ignore the weakness in the legal and institutional system of the United Nations, and its inability in many cases to apply standards of justice and equity in its work mechanisms. A consistently recurring pattern in these cases is the Security Council’s selectivity in addressing issues, particularly when it comes to states’ use of force in international relation.”⁽¹⁴⁸⁾

Moreover, during his participation in an international video meeting to celebrate the 75th anniversary of the founding of the UN, the Emir of the State of Qatar, Sheikh Tamim bin Hamad Al Thani, criticized the Security Council’s weakness in dealing with many issues pertaining to the Middle East region, especially the Palestinian issue and the Syrian crisis. He said in this context:

“We call on the international community - especially the Security Council - to fulfill its legal responsibility and oblige Israel to lift the siege on the Gaza Strip and return the peace process to its track through credible negotiations, based on international resolutions and not on force.”⁽¹⁴⁹⁾ He also went on to say that:

“More than nine years have passed since the Syrian crisis and the unprecedented humanitarian tragedies it has witnessed, the serious negative effects of which are worsening year after year. It is still impossible to reach an end to this crisis due to the obstinacy of the Syrian regime and the failure of the international community,

(148) <https://www.gco.gov.qa/ar/speeches/his-highness-speech-at-the-71st-general-assembly-of-the-united-nation/>

(149) <https://diwan.gov.qa/briefing-room/speeches-and-remarks/2020/september/22/hh-the-amir-speech-at-the-high-level-meeting-to-commemorate-75th-anniversary-of-un>

especially the Security Council, to play its role in maintaining international peace and security and protecting civilians.”⁽¹⁵⁰⁾

In 2017, Qatar hosted the work of the informal conference to “revitalize the debate on Security Council reform”. The conference concluded by calling for just and realistic reform. Qatari Minister of State for Foreign Affairs Sultan bin Saad Al Muraikhi said at the conclusion of the conference that achieving peace and stability in the world requires the presence of an effective SC capable of facing challenges. Al-Muraikhi added that the current international crises demonstrated the need for fair and realistic reform of the SC as part of the reform of the UN.⁽¹⁵¹⁾ In 2018, the State of Qatar again expressed its support for the reform of the UNSC, and called for improvements of the Council’s working methods and decision-making mechanism.⁽¹⁵²⁾ It called for a comprehensive reform that makes the SC more inclusive, democratic and representative of all regions, adding that the reform should reflect the prevailing geopolitical realities in today’s world.⁽¹⁵³⁾ Qatar also stressed that the veto is a central issue in the reform process, explaining that experience had shown that restricting or refraining from using it, would help to prevent serious crimes such as war crimes, genocide or ethnic cleansing.⁽¹⁵⁴⁾ It pointed out that the real reform process should go hand by hand with the interaction and dialogue with non-members of the council to enhance its efficiency and transparency.⁽¹⁵⁵⁾

In appreciation of the great efforts of the State of Qatar in this field, the President of the UNGA, *Volkan Bozkir*, decided to appoint Ambassador Alia Ahmed bin Saif Al Thani, Permanent Representative of the State of Qatar, and Ambassador Joanna

(150) Ibid.

(151) <https://www.aljazeera.net/news/2017/1/15/%D9%85%D8%A4%D8%AA%D9%85%D8%B1-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%AF%D9%88%D8%AD>.

(152) “This came in a statement by the State of Qatar delivered by Mr. Talal bin Rashid Al Khalifa, Second Secretary in the Permanent Delegation of the State of Qatar to the United Nations, at the session of the United Nations General Assembly at its seventy-third session on the item “The issue of fair representation in the Security Council and increasing the number of its members and issues other matters related to the Security Council.”

(153) Qatar calls for comprehensive Reform of the UNSC, <https://mofa.gov.qa/en/all-mofa-news/details/2018/11/21/qatar-calls-for-comprehensive-reform-of-un-security-council#:~:text=The%20State%20of%20Qatar%20expressed,enhance%20its%20efficiency%20and%20transparenc>.

(154) Ibid.

(155) Ibid.

Veronica, Permanent Representative of Poland, to lead the facilitation of negotiations on the reform of the UNSC. This came in accordance with the General Assembly's resolutions calling for reforming the SC by achieving fair representation, increasing the number of its members, and other aspects.⁽¹⁵⁶⁾ Bahrain's representative also reiterated the Arab Group's demand for a permanent Arab seat, as well as proportionate Arab representation among non-permanent Council members.⁽¹⁵⁷⁾ Jordan was one of the countries that suggested that Japan and Germany should have permanent membership with the right of veto. It insisted on the importance of making fair and just representation for all countries.⁽¹⁵⁸⁾ The Jordanian proposal also called for granting permanent seats to the African, Asian and Latin American continents, and ensuring that these countries are granted the right of veto.⁽¹⁵⁹⁾ Furthermore, the Jordanian proposals also included increasing the number of non-permanent SC members from 10 to 15 seats.⁽¹⁶⁰⁾

Algeria was also in favor of having a comprehensive reform for the SC, which should take into account the five fundamental elements that were agreed among the UN members, which includes types of membership, right of veto, regional representation, the size of the expanded SC, its working methods and its relation with the GA.⁽¹⁶¹⁾ The permanent representative of Algeria to the UNGA strongly demanded the need for correction of the historical injustice that Africa continent suffers from by granting it two permanent seats within the framework of the reform of the UNSC.⁽¹⁶²⁾ He stressed the need to seize the opportunity of the progress achieved so far, in order to reach a more representative, democratic, effective and transparent council. Most recently, Algeria's Minister of Foreign Affairs, *Ramtane Lamamra*, called for

(156) <https://www.aljazeera.net/politics/2020/11/19/%D9%85%D8%AC%D9%84%D8%B3-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%86-%D9%82%D8%B7%D8%B1-%D8%A8%D9%88%D9%84%D9%86%D8%AF%D8%A7>

(157) <https://press.un.org/en/2022/ga12472.doc.htm>

(158) See Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp. 411-412.

(159) See Sami Jad Wasel, *supra* note 108, pp. 411-412.

(160) *Ibid*, see also Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, *supra* note 89, p.104.

(161) Bekhouche, *supra* note 51, p.121.

(162) Africa's Quest for Reform of the United Nations Security Council: A Just Cause Curbed by Unrealistic Proposals, available at <https://www.accord.org.za/ajcr-issues/africas-quest-for-reform-of-the-united-nations-security-council-a-just-cause-curbed-by-unrealistic-proposals/>

a reform of the UNSC, so that Africa can have two permanent seats.⁽¹⁶³⁾ He insisted that *“Africa has the right to suggest its proposal repeatedly for the reform of the UN SC,” “This will end the oppression that has lasted for eight decades.”*⁽¹⁶⁴⁾

3.4. Some Other Initiatives and Proposals Related to Reforming the SC:

Additionally, some other proposals regarding the SC reform came from many academic and research institutions.⁽¹⁶⁵⁾ The supporters of those initiatives offered some suggestions such as using a rule for membership succession, such as the alphabetical sequence of letters. In such a case, the seat is a regional seat with successive occupants, the holder of this seat will not have the right to veto. It was also suggested that the selection would be based on the extent of the state’s commitment to serving the issues of the international community and the extent of its achievement in this field, provided that two seats are allocated to the North and the South, and the countries remain under it for a longer period than the current situation in the SC.⁽¹⁶⁶⁾

There were those who proposed the 5 + 5 formula, which allows Germany and Japan to be given two permanent seats without obtaining a veto, and 3 seats for regional powers representing the continent of Latin America, Africa, and Asia, and 5 non-permanent seats. It also proposed a formula of 4+1+2+3, which allocates two permanent seats to Germany and Japan without veto power, 3 semi-permanent seats to the continent of Asia, South America and Africa, a special seat to a world-class power, and 4 non-permanent seats to be filled alternately between countries.⁽¹⁶⁷⁾

(163) <https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20221208-algeria-calls-for-reform-of-un-security-council/>

(164) Ibid.

(165) Heba Alqodsy, The struggle for Influence Within the Security Council, (Article in Arabic Language), <https://aawsat.com/home/article/14698>.

(166) For more details, see Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, *supra* note 89, pp.104-105.

(167) There were also other formulas such as 2+6+2 and 5+5 for more details see Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, *supra* note 89, pp.104-105.

Conclusion:

We have discussed in this paper the SC reform. This issue has been the subject of long debates and disagreement among countries, since the establishment of the UN. This study has shown that the UN, as an international organization, suffers from the presence of many difficulties and challenges. In general, it suffers in terms of its structural composition, slowness in making decisions, and being influenced by the political factors and interests of its members. Therefore, there have been many repeated calls demanding a comprehensive and radical reform process of the UN and its various organs, particularly the SC.

It is worth noting that, the reform projects, some of which we have referred to in this paper, have been presented by some countries and official figures, such as the Secretaries-General of the UN, academic and research institutions and bodies. These proposals have generally focused on some issues, the most important of which is increasing the number of non-permanent seats. The second issue is increasing the number of permanent seats and including some countries in the list of the five superpowers, such as Germany, Japan, and others. The reform projects also focused on the importance of reviewing the voting mechanism in the SC, particularly to the right of veto. There are many demands on the part of many countries to demolish this privilege or if it is not abolished, to limit it and reduce its use to the least possible extent, with the necessity of setting controls or standards for cases in which the five countries can resort to it.

This study has also shown that the issue of achieving reform or putting it into practice is not an easy task. Despite the change in international circumstances and the emergence of new players on the international scene, hopes for the desired change and reform for the UN in general and for the SC in particular still remain far-fetched and difficult to verify on the ground.

The major countries, despite their theoretical support for the idea of reform, in reality still reject any reform project that affects their rights and interests. There is no room, for example, to change the veto right, nor to grant it to other countries, nor can they accept any amendment to the provisions of the Charter, that specifies how and when they can resort to this right. Accordingly, we can clearly say that the

reform projects that have been presented so far, remain ink on paper, in light of the current international reality controlled by a group of countries. In other words, they are merely dreams, ambitions and hopes for the developing countries, but in practice they are not possible to be achieved without the consensus and acceptance of the major or powerful countries.

Therefore, the reform process requires great and continuous efforts and pressure, particularly from the concerned countries and the peoples affected by the current situation, in order to persuade these countries to give up some of these privileges. This work clearly requires more cooperation, working hand in hand and constructive dialogue among all UN members. Despite what was said previously, there remains an inescapable and constant fact, which is that the UN exists to remain and continue. We cannot imagine the world without it, and it is difficult to find an alternative to it at the present time, but what we hope, is that the work of the UN organization will improve and that there will actually be a real reform in its structure and decision-making mechanism, especially in the SC, in order to serve the peoples for whom the organization was established. This reform should be substantial, real, efficient and able to reflect the current changes that have occurred on the international arena. In conclusion, we recommend the following:

1. States should work together to amend the Charter of the UN, in the manner drawn up in this regard to make the required and necessary amendments that are in the interest of this important international organization and in a way that is consistent with current international developments.
2. Working together to unify the various efforts towards the process of reforming the SC, so that the proposed reform process takes into account, by consensus among the relevant countries, the issue of achieving equitable geographical representation of the continents and the political changes that occurred after World War II.
3. The current composition of the SC must be reconsidered and the membership in the SC must be expanded, whether in terms of permanent or non-permanent membership. The increase must be proportionate to the nature of the SC and its basic role of maintaining international peace and security. The point is not

the increase the numbers of state members, but what is important here is the effectiveness of the SC and its ability to take critical decisions in a timely manner with complete transparency and objectivity.

4. Serious work should also be done towards obligating permanent member states not to abuse the veto right, which was granted to them randomly. The SC members should adopt certain controls and standards, in order to restrict the use of the veto right to the narrowest limits, with the necessity of not using this dangerous weapon in some cases, especially those related to human rights violations and the commission of international crimes such as war crimes, genocide, crimes against humanity and the crime of aggression.
5. Activating the role of the GA in the field of oversight of the SC, especially in matters that threaten international peace and security, and enabling the GA to monitor the SC on the issue of using the veto, especially in cases where its use is repeated by one or more of its permanent members.
6. Activating the role of the GA in the field of maintaining international peace and security, especially within the framework of the Uniting for Peace Resolution (UNPR), which gives the GA the authority to consider the issue and deal with it in the event of the Security Council's inability to take decisions due to the use of the veto by the permanent members of the SC.
7. Arab and Islamic countries in general must coordinate their efforts within the framework of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) and other groups within the UN, in order to ensure that they obtain fair representation within the SC. This matter requires continuous and ongoing coordination between these countries to reach this goal.

References

Books and Articles in Arabic Language:

- Abo Baker Aldosokey, Sixty Years from the UN: Obstacles Before Reform, (Article in Arabic Language), Published in Political Science Journal, Issue 162, 2005.
- Ayed Al-Mashagheh, The United Nations Security Council, It's Role in Enhancing the International Criminal Justice, (Book in Arabic, PhD thesis), published, Aldar Alalmiah for Publishing and Distribution, 2018.
- Edress lakreny, The Security Council in a Changing World: The Reality of Deviation and the Requirements for Reform, (Arabic Article), <https://www.mohamy.online/blog/11241/%D9%85%D8%AC%D9%84%D8%B3-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%86-%D9%81%D9%8A-%D8%B9%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%85>.
- FeKrat Alaney, The New International Environment and Necessities for UN Reform, (Article in Arabic Language, published 2023), available at <https://www.iasj.net/iasj/download/45bd61b644520292>.
- H. Bekhouche, The Need to Reform the United Nations, (Article published in Arabic), 2021, Volume 5, Number 2, available at <https://www.asjp.cerist.dz/en/article/172504>.
- Hassan Nafiah, Why the UN Must Reform the Security Council, available at <https://www.swissinfo.ch/ara/business/%D9%84%D9%85%D8%A7%D8%B0%D8%A7-%D9%8A%D8%AC%D8%A8-%D8%B9%D9%84%D9%89-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%85>.
- Heba Alqodsy, The struggle for Influence Within the Security Council, (Article in Arabic Language), <https://aawsat.com/home/article/14698>.
- Kalfan Kreem, The Security Council and the Challenges of Global Peace and Security, a Study in Light of Proposals for Reform of the United Nations, (Article in Arabic Language), Al-Feker Journal, Volume 9, Number 1, 2014, pp.39-59 available <https://www.asjp.cerist.dz/en/article/39475>.

- Khalid Alyemany, The Reality of Security Council Reform (Article in Arabic language), available at <https://www.independentarabia.com/node/463541/%D8%A2%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%A1/%D8%AD%D9%82%>.
- Mekhled Altarawneh, An Introduction to International Organizations, (Book in Arabic Language) Dar Al Badeel for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan, 2023.
- Mekhled Altarawneh, The Legality of Humanitarian Intervention in the Light of UN Charter and Contemporary International Law, (PhD), Aberdeen University, UK, 1999, published in 2023, Dar Athaqafa, Amman, Jordan, 2023.
- Mofeed Shehab, International Organizations, (Book in Arabic Language), Dar Al-Nahda, Egypt, 1985.
- Mohammad Almjoud, Alwaseet in International Organizations (Book in Arabic Language), Al-Halabi Legal Publications, Beirut, 2018.
- Riyed Mahdi Abed Alkazem, Obstacles to Security Council Reform and New International Changes, Political Science Journal, Issue 60, 2020, pp.97-98. Available at <https://jcopolicy.uobaghdad.edu.iq/index.php/jcopolicy/article/view/487/399>
- Sami Jad Wasel, Reform of Security Council, (Article published in Arabic), in Journal of Law and economics, issue 95.

Books in English Language:

- Ademola Abass, International Law, Oxford University Press, 212.
- Martin Dixon, International Law, 7th ed, Oxford University Press, 2013.
- M. Shaw, International Law, 3 ed, Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Articles In English Language:

- Africa's Quest for Reform of the United Nations Security Council: A Just Cause Curbed by Unrealistic Proposals, available at <https://www.accord.org.za/ajcr-issues/africas-quest-for-reform-of-the-united-nations-security-council-a-just-cause-curbed-by-unrealistic-proposals/>
- André Nollkaemper, Three Options for the Veto Power After the War in Ukraine, available at <https://www.ejiltalk.org/three-options-for-the-veto-power-after-the-war-in-ukraine/>.
- Anjali Dayal and Caroline Dunton, The UN Security Council was Designed for Deadlock, Can it Change? <https://www.usip.org/publications/2023/03/un-security-council-was-designed-deadlock-can-it-change>.
- Aude Darnal, Biden and the United Nations Security Council Reform: True Commitment or Tokenism? available <https://www.stimson.org/2022/biden-and-the-united-nations-security-council-reform-true-commitment-or-tokenism/>.
- Bertrand Ramcharan, A New International Law of Security and Protection, available at <https://www.un.org/en/chronicle/article/new-international-law-security-and-protection#:~:text=Sovereign%20states%20still%20predominate%20and,powerful%20states%20or%20voting%20majorities>
- Boutros Boutros-Ghali on Security Council Reform, Magisterial Lecture on Security Council Reform, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Mexico City, Mexico, 4 March 1996, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/security-council/security-council-reform/32814-boutros-boutros-ghali-on-security-council-reform.html>.
- Brian Lai, Vanessa A. Lefler, UN Security Council Nonpermanent Membership: Equitable Distribution for Equitable Representation?? available at <https://my-web.uiowa.edu/bhlai/workshop/lailefler.pdf>.

- Bruno Simma and others, eds., *The Charter of the United Nations: A Commentary* vol. I., 3d ed. (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2012).
- Can the UN Charter be amended, and how many times has this occurred? Available at <https://ask.un.org/faq/140440#:~:text=The%20Charter%20has%20been%20amended,votes%20from%207%20to%209.>
- Climate change and human rights – Can the courts fix it? <https://reliefweb.int/report/world/climate-change-and-human-rights-can-courts-fix-it>
- Conflict in Ukraine: A timeline (2014 - eve of 2022 invasion) available at <https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/cbp-9476/>
- Crime and Contagion: The Impact of a Pandemic on Organized Crime, <https://globalinitiative.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/GI-TOC-Crime-and-Contagion->
- David L. Hoffmann, *The Soviet Collapse*, article published in 2021, https://origins.osu.edu/article/soviet-collapse-yeltsin-putin-gorbachev-russia?language_content_entity=en <https://www.un.org/dgacm/ar/content/regional-groups>.
- Dilip Sinha, *Veto Provisions in UN Charter: Issues and Dimensions*, *Indian Foreign Affairs Journal*, Vol. 14, No. 4, Special Issue: India and the 'UN@75' (October–December, 2019), pp. 267-274 (8 pages), Published by: Prints Publications Pvt Ltd, available at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/48636736>.
- Elisabetta Martini, *UN SC Reform: Current Developments*, <https://www.iai.it/sites/default/files/iai0926.pdf>.
- Gareth Evans Stewart Patrick and Homas Leney, *Threats, Challenges and Change: The UN in the 21st Century*, available at <https://www.wilsoncenter.org/event/threats-challenges-and-change-the-united-nations-the-21st-century>.
- Hans Kelsen, *The Principles of Sovereign Equality of States as a Basis For International Organizations*, https://openyls.law.yale.edu/bitstream/handle/20.500.13051/13231/17_53YaleLJ207_1943_1944_.pdf?sequence=2&isAllowed=y .

- Helge Holtermann, Poverty and Civil War: An Assessment of Four Prominent Explanations of the Per Capita Income-Civil War Relationship, available at <https://www.duo.uio.no/bitstream/handle/10852/14771/Thesis6.pdf?sequence=2>
- James Paul, NGOs and the Security Council, article published 2004 available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/security-council/ngo-working-group-on-the-security-council/40406.html#background>).
- Javier Santiago OrtizCorrea and Ariel Dina Civil War's Impact on The Environment and on Access to Water and Sanitation Services: The Case of Colombia, Sustainable Water Resources Management (2022) 8:151 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40899-022-00718-w>, available at <https://escholarship.org/content/qt0t41k9vx/qt0t41k9vx.pdf>.
- Jennifer Trahan, Existing Legal Limits to SCVeto Power in the Face of Atrocity Crimes, Published online by Cambridge University Press: 15 August 2020, available at <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/existing-legal-limits-to-security-council-veto-power-in-the-face-of-atrocity-crimes/introduction/02FE-B9A9FFFA863F492EE2AC079FB49D>.
- Jennifer Trahan, Why the Veto Power Is Not Unlimited: A Response to Critiques of, and Questions About, Existing Legal Limits to the Veto Power in the Face of Atrocity Crimes, Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law (JIL), volume 54, Issue 1, 2022, available <https://scholarlycommons.law.case.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2628&context=jil> .
- Jens Martens, 2005, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/images/pdfs/briefing.pdf>.
- John B. Bellinger, How Russia's Invasion of Ukraine Violates International Law, February 28, 2022, available <https://www.cfr.org/article/how-russias-invasion-ukraine-violates-international-law>.
- Kapil Kak, Humanitarian Intervention and the Changing Role of the UN, A Monthly Journal of the IDSA, October 2000 (Vol. XXIV No. 7), [Shttps://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/olj/sa/sa_oct00kak01.html](https://ciaotest.cc.columbia.edu/olj/sa/sa_oct00kak01.html).

- Manish S. Dabhade, India's Pursuit of UNSC Reforms, Volume 2, Issue 3 (Rising India and Its Global Governance Imperatives), Aug. 2017, pp. 63-73, available at <https://risingpowersproject.com/indias-pursuit-united-nations-security-council-reforms/>.
- Mark Kramer, The Collapse of the Former Soviet Union, Journal of Cold War Studies, Volume 5, Issue 1, Winter 2003, available at <https://direct.mit.edu/jcws/article-abstract/5/1/3/12584/Introduction?redirectedFrom=fulltext>.
- Mearsheimer, The Causes and Consequences of the Ukraine War, <https://www.cirsd.org/en/horizons/horizons-summer-2022-issue-no.21/the-causes-and-consequences-of-the-ukraine-war>.
- Michelle Bachelet, On May, 2021, <https://www.ohchr.org/en/2021/05/protecting-human-rights-role-un-security-council>.
- Press Releases SC/14808 and SC/14809
- Qatar calls for comprehensive Reform of the UNSC, <https://mofa.gov.qa/en/all-mofa-news/details/2018/11/21/qatar-calls-for-comprehensive-reform-of-un-security-council#:~:text=The%20State%20of%20Qatar%20expressed,enhance%20its%20efficiency%20and%20transparenc>.
- Rajiv Bahatia, A Proposal for UN Security Council Reform, Task force: Towards Reformed Multilateralism: Transforming Global Institutions and Frameworks, May, 2023 available at <https://policycommons.net/artifacts/3793075/a-proposal-for-un/4598910/>.
- Reform of the UN Security Council, available at <https://www.auswaertiges-amt.de/en/aussenpolitik/internationale-organisationen/vereintenationen/reforms-r/231604#:~:text=When%20the%20Charter%20of%20the,came%20into%20force%20in%201965>.
- Richard Croker, Russia's Justification for Using its Veto on Syria is Pure Fiction, available at
- S.C. res. S2022/155 (Feb.25,2022), draft resolution.

- SC Must Reflect Twenty-First Century Realities, Delegates Tell General Assembly, with Many Calling for Urgent Expansion of Permanent Seats, available at <https://press.un.org/en/2020/ga12288.doc.htm>.
- Scott Neuman and Alyson Hurt, The Ripple Effects of Russia's War in Ukraine Continue to Change the World, February 22, 2023, <https://www.npr.org/2023/02/22/1157106172/ukraine-russia-war-refugees-food-prices>.
- Secretary General Kofi Annan's Reform Agenda - 1997 to 2006, available at <https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html#:~:text=In%20March%202005%2C%20Annan%20presented,replacing%20the%20Human%20Rights%20Commission>.
- Security Council Reform: 67th Session, 67th SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY, REPORTS & ANALYSES, available at <https://centerforunreform.org/security-council-reform-67th-session/>.
- Stevens Lloyd Osisoma, The United Nations and Collective Security, GSC Advanced Research and Reviews, 2023, 14(02), 115–120, Article DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30574/gscarr.2023.14.2.0014>, available at <https://gsconlinepress.com/journals/gscarr/sites/default/files/GSCARR-2023-0014.pdf>.
- Stewart Patrick, Cutting the Gordian Knot: Global Perspectives on UN SC Reform, <https://carnegieendowment.org/2023/06/28/un-security-council-reform-what-world-thinks-pub-90032#:~:text=Even%20as%20the%20UN's%20overall,from%20eleven%20to%20fifteen%20members>.
- The Practical Guide to Humanitarian Law, 2023, available at <https://guide-humanitarian-law.org/content/article/3/collective-security/>
- The right to veto - <https://www.justsecurity.org/81294/the-united-nations-in-hind-sight-challenging-the-power-of-the-security-council-veto/>.
- The Role of the UN Security Council", Institute of International and Europe-

an Affairs, Keynote Speech by United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, https://www2.ohchr.org/english/OHCHRreport2017/allegati/2_About_UN_Human_Rights_2017.pdf.

- The speech of Under-Secretary General A. DICARLO'S Remarks to the SC on Maintenance of Peace and Security of Ukraine, New York, 23 June 2023 <https://dppa.un.org/en/msg-usg-dicarlo-sc-9357-ukraine-23-jun-23>.
- The-impact-of-a-pandemic-on-organized-crime-1.pdf. the UN report about conflicts and violence <https://www.un.org/en/un75/new-era-conflict-and-violence>
- UN General Assembly 21 July 2022 (Transcript of the speech, exactly as it was delivered <https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/russias-justification-for-using-its-veto-on-syria-is-pure-fiction.ar>).
- UNSC,8979 meeting agenda, S?pV.8979, at 6.
- Wanda Troszczynska-Van Genderen, Reforming the United Nations: State of Play, Ways Forward, [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/536435/EXPO_STU\(2015\)536435_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/536435/EXPO_STU(2015)536435_EN.pdf)).
- War in Ukraine, Center Prevention Action, August 15, 2023, <https://www.cfr.org/global-conflict-tracker/conflict/conflict-ukraine>.
- What You Need To Know About the Russian and Ukrainian Conflict available at https://giveuao.org/2023/05/24/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-russian-and-ukrainian-conflict/?gclid=EAIaIQobChMIiODL9uDAgQM-VCE4YCh0wZQ4mEAAYAiAAEgLq1fD_BwE.
- Yehuda Z. Blum, Russia Takes Over the Soviet Union's Seat at the United Nations, 3 Euro. J. Int'l.354,356, 1992. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ejil/3.2.354>.

Other References From Websites:

- <https://euneighbourseast.eu/young-european-ambassadors/blog/blog-does-russia-legitimately-occupy-its-seat-as-a-permanent-member-of-the-un-security-council/#:~:text=Instead%2C%20Russia%20took%20over%20the,other%20United%20Nations%20organs%20were.>
- <https://arabic.cnn.com/world/article/2022/12/26/ukraine-calls-for-exclusion-of-russia-from-united-nations.>
- [https://archive.globalpolicy.org/images/pdfs/briefing.pdf,](https://archive.globalpolicy.org/images/pdfs/briefing.pdf)
- [https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html.](https://archive.globalpolicy.org/un-reform/un-reform-initiatives/secretary-general-kofi-annans-reform-agenda-1997-to-2006.html)
- [https://ask.un.org/faq/14518.](https://ask.un.org/faq/14518)
- <https://diwan.gov.qa/briefing-room/speeches-and-remarks/2020/september/22/hh-the-amir-speech-at-the-high-level-meeting-to-commemorate-75th-anniversary-of-un>
- [https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/186/66/PDF/NR018666.pdf?OpenElement.](https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/186/66/PDF/NR018666.pdf?OpenElement)
- <https://law.stanford.edu/2023/02/21/stanfords-allen-weiner-on-russias-invasion-of-ukraine-and-the-laws-of-war/>
- <https://legal.un.org/committees/charter/> Special Committee on the Charter of the United Nations and on the Strengthening of the Role of the Organization.
- [https://news.un.org/en/story/2022/04/1115782.](https://news.un.org/en/story/2022/04/1115782)
- <https://press.un.org/en/1996/19961030.ga9147.html>
- <https://press.un.org/en/2022/ga12472.doc.htm>

- <https://research.un.org/en/unmembers/scmembers>,
- https://unrcca.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/4-unrcca_handout_collective_security_system_eng_2020.pdf.
- <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/4/19/un-to-debate-security-council-permanent-member-veto-power>
- https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/united-nations/?utm_source=google&utm_medium=cpc&gclid=EAIaIQobChMI1KzgoY3QgQMVzgWiAx-2f7AoPEAAAYAiAAEgLSJPD_BwE.
- <https://www.archives.gov/research/foreign-policy/cold-war/symposium/cleveland.html>)
- <https://www.brookings.edu/articles/how-russias-invasion-of-ukraine-tested-the-international-legal-order/>.
- https://www.business-standard.com/article/international/russia-strongly-supports-reform-of-un-security-council-says-lavrov-123012400017_1.html
- <https://www.cfr.org/background/un-security-council>
- <https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/reform>
- <https://www.france24.com/ar/20170923%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%A3%D9%85%D9%85>. <https://www.un.org/en/ga/contributions/honourroll.shtml>
- <https://www.gco.gov.qa/ar/speeches/his-highness-speech-at-the-71st-general-assembly-of-the-united-nation/>
- <https://www.humanrights.com/voices-for-human-rights/human-rights-organizations/non-governmental.html>
- <https://www.iasj.net/iasj/article/37225>

- <https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20221208-algeria-calls-for-reform-of-un-security-council/>
- <https://www.mofa.go.jp/files/100059111.pdf>
- <https://www.ohchr.org/en/hr-bodies/hrc/about-council>.
- https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/Publications/FSheet38_FAQ_HR_CC_EN.pdf.
- <https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/un-security-council-working-methods/the-veto.php>
- <https://www.un.org/ar/ga/67/resolutions.shtml>).
- <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/history-of-the-un>. The provisions of the UN Charter, available at <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter/full-text>
- <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/main-bodies>.
- <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/un-charter#:~:text=Since%20the%20UN's%20founding%20in,1963%2C%201965%2C%20and%201973>.
- <https://www.archives.gov/research/foreign-policy/cold-war/symposium/cleveland.html>)

إصلاح مجلس الأمن التابع للأمم المتحدة؛ بين الواقع والمأمول (دراسة نقدية وتحليلية)

الأستاذ الدكتور/ مخلص الطراونة

عضو هيئة التدريس - كلية الشرطة، أكاديمية الشرطة، دولة قطر